Force and Torque while Frying an Egg

Kirk T. McDonald
Joseph Henry Laboratories, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ 08544
(February 27, 2020)

As an egg is fried, its thermal energy, and hence its mass, increases.[1,2] When viewed from an inertial frame f in which the center of mass of the egg has position $\mathbf{r}_{\rm cm}$ and constant velocity $\mathbf{v} = \mathbf{v}_{\rm cm} = d\mathbf{r}_{\rm cm}/dt$, the (linear) momentum $\mathbf{P} = m(t)\mathbf{v}_{\rm cm}$ of the egg increases with time, as also does its angular momentum $\mathbf{L} = (\mathbf{r}_{\rm cm} - \mathbf{r}_0) \times \mathbf{P} + I_{\rm cm}\,\boldsymbol{\omega} = (\mathbf{r}_{\rm cm} - \mathbf{r}_0) \times m\mathbf{v}_{\rm cm}$ about any fixed point $\mathbf{r}_0$ (in inertial frame f) not on the trajectory of the center of mass of the egg.

Observers in inertial frame f consider that there exists a nonzero force,

$$\mathbf{F} = \frac{d\mathbf{P}}{dt} = \frac{dm}{dt}\mathbf{v}_{\rm cm}, \tag{1}$$

on the egg, exerted by the frying pan. The torque $\boldsymbol{\tau}$ of this force about reference point $\mathbf{r}_0$ is,

$$\boldsymbol{\tau} = (\mathbf{r}_{\rm cm} - \mathbf{r}_0) \times \mathbf{F} = (\mathbf{r}_{\rm cm} - \mathbf{r}_0) \times \frac{dm}{dt}\mathbf{v}_{\rm cm} = \frac{d}{dt}[(\mathbf{r}_{\rm cm} - \mathbf{r}_0) \times m\mathbf{v}_{\rm cm}] = \frac{d\mathbf{L}}{dt}\,. \tag{2}$$

Thus, while the (variable-mass) frying egg moves with constant velocity $\mathbf{v}$ in inertial frame f, without rotation about its center of mass, it is associated with nonzero, time-dependent force, torque, linear and angular momentum.[3,4]

This example was suggested by Daniel Vanzella [48]. Related comments by the present author are in [49].

References

[1] F.T. Trouton, *The Result of an Electrical Experiment, Involving the Relative Motion of the Earth and Ether, Suggested by the Late Professor FitzGerald*, Sci. Trans. Roy. Dublin Soc. **7**, 379 (1902), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/trouton_strds_7_379_02.pdf

[2] F.T. Trouton and H.R. Noble, *The Mechanical Forces Acting on a Charged Electric Condenser moving through Space*, Phil. Trans. Roy. Soc. London A **202**, 165 (1903), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/trouton_ptrsla_202_165_03.pdf

[1] We suppose that the egg and the frying pan are not rotating in their (inertial) rest frame.

[2] As the temperature of the egg increases by ΔT, its mass increases by $\Delta U/c^2 = C\Delta T/c^2$, where C is the heat capacity of the egg and c is the speed of light in vacuum. Thus, we might say that frying an egg is a "relativistic" phenomenon.

[3] The momentum $\mathbf{P}$ of the egg in frame f is "overt", and not "hidden" in the sense discussed in [47].

[4] *Oct. 25, 2020.* Some people have claimed that if an object experiences no torque in its (inertial) rest frame, there is no torque on it in any other inertial frame. A partial history of this controversy, related to the Trouton-Noble experiment, can be traced in [1]-[46].

[3] H.A. Lorentz, *Electromagnetic phenomena in a system moving with any velocity smaller than that of light*, Proc. Roy. Acad. Amsterdam **6**, 809 (1904). See p. 825.
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/EM/lorentz_pknaw_6_809_04.pdf

[4] G.N. Lewis and R.C. Tolman, *The Principle of Relativity, and Non-Newtonian Mechanics*, Phil. Mag. **18**, 510 (1909),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/lewis_pm_18_510_09.pdf

[5] R.C. Tolman, *Non-Newtonian Mechanics:—The Direction of Force and Acceleration*, Phil. Mag. **22**, 488 (1911),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/tolman_pm_22_458_11.pdf

[6] M. Laue, *Ein Beispiel zur Dynamik der Relativitätstheorie*, Verh. Deutsch. Phys. Gesell. **13**, 513 (1911), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/vonlaue_vdpg_13_513_11.pdf
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/vonlaue_vdpg_13_513_11_english.pdf

[7] M. Laue, *Zur Dynamik der Relativitätstheorie*, Ann. d. Phys. **35**, 524 (1911),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/vonlaue_ap_35_524_11.pdf
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/vonlaue_ap_35_524_11_english.pdf

[8] P.S. Epstein, *Über relativistische Statik*, Ann. d. Phys. **36**, 779 (1911),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/epstein_ap_36_779_11.pdf
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/epstein_ap_36_779_11_english.pdf

[9] M. Laue, *Bemerkungen zum Hebelgesetz in der Relativitätstheorie*, Phys. Z. **12**, 1008 (1911), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/vonlaue_pz_12_1008_11.pdf
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/vonlaue_pz_12_1008_11_english.pdf

[10] M. Laue, *Zur Theorie des Versuches von Trouton und Noble*, Ann. d. Phys. **38**, 370 (1912), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/vonlaue_ap_38_370_12.pdf
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/vonlaue_ap_38_370_12_english.pdf

[11] E.H. Kennard, *The Trouton-Noble Experiment*, Bull. Natl. Res. Council **4**-24, 162 (1922), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/kennard_bnrc_4-24_162_22.pdf

[12] H. Arzeliès, *Sur le problème relativiste du levier coudé*, Nuovo Cim. **35**, 783 (1965),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/statmech/arzelies_nc_35_783_65.pdf

[13] H. Arzeliès, *Transformation relativiste de la temperáture et de quelques autres grandeurs thermodynamiques*, Nuovo Cim. **35**, 792 (1965),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/statmech/arzelies_nc_35_792_65.pdf

[14] T.W.B. Kibble, *Relativistic Transformation Laws for Thermodynamic Variables*, Nuovo Cim. B **41**, 72 (1966), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/statmech/kibble_nc_41b_72_66.pdf

[15] F. Rohrlich, *True and Apparent Transformations, Classical Electrons, and Relativistic Thermodynamics*, Nuovo Cim. B **45**, 76 (1966),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/rohrlich_nc_45b_76_66.pdf

[16] R.G. Newburgh, *The Relativistic Problem of the Right-Angled Lever: The Correctness of the Laue Solution*, Nuovo Cim. B **61**, 201 (1969),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/newburgh_nc_61b_201_69.pdf

[17] S. Aranoff, *Torques and Angular Momentum on a System in Equilibrium in Special Relativity*, Am. J. Phys. **37**, 453 (1969),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/aranoff_ajp_37_453_69.pdf

[18] G. Cavalleri and G. Salgarelli, *Revision of the Relativistic Dynamics with Variable Rest Mass and Application to Relativistic Thermodynamics*, Nuovo Cim. A **62**, 722 (1969),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/cavalleri_nc_62a_722_69.pdf

[19] J.H. Fremlin, *Relativity and the Lever Problem*, Contemp. Phys. **10**, 179 (1969),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/fremlin_cp_10_179_69.pdf

[20] J. Strnad, *Relativity and the Lever Problem*, Contemp. Phys. **11**, 59 (1970),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/strnad_cp_11_59_70.pdf

[21] J.W. Butler, *The Lewis-Tolman Lever Paradox*, Am. J. Phys. **38**, 360 (1970),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/butler_ajp_38_360_70.pdf

[22] W.K.H. Panofsky and M. Phillips, *Torques and Angular Momentum on a System in Equilibrium in Special Relativity: A Reply*, Am. J. Phys. **38**, 547 (1970),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/panofsky_ajp_38_547_70.pdf

[23] L. Karlov, *On the Transformation of Force in Relativistic Statics*, Lett. Nuovo Cim. **3**, 37 (1970), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/karlov_lnc_3_37_70.pdf

[24] J.R. Ray, *Reply to Karlov's Article on the Transformation of Force in Special Relativity*, Lett. Nuovo Cim. **3**, 739 (1970), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/ray_lnc_3_739_70.pdf

[25] K.A. Johns, *The Paradoxical Behaviour of Force in Special Relativity*, Lett. Nuovo Cim. **4**, 351 (1970), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/johns_lnc_4_351_70.pdf

[26] F.W. Sears, *Another Relativistic Paradox*, Am. J. Phys. **40**, 771 (1972),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/sears_ajp_40_771_72.pdf

[27] S. Aranoff, *Equilibrium in Special Relativity*, Nuovo Cim. B **10**, 155 (1972),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/aranoff_nc_10b_155_72.pdf

[28] Ø. Grøn, *The Asynchronous Formulation of Relativistic Statics and Thermodynamics*, Nuovo Cim. B **17**, 141 (1973),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/gron_nc_17b_141_73.pdf

[29] S. Aranoff, *More on the Right-Angled Lever at Equilibrium in Special Relativity*, Am. J. Phys. **40**, 1108 (1973),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/aranoff_ajp_40_1108_73.pdf

[30] S. Pahor and J.Strnad, *Statics in Special Relativity*, Nuovo Cim. B **20**, 105 (1974),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/pahor_nc_b20_105_74.pdf

[31] G. Cavalleri, G. Spavieri and G. Spinelli, *Ropes and Pulleys in Special Relativity (Relativistic Statics of Threads)*, Nuovo Cim. B **25**, 348 (1975), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/cavalleri_nc_25b_348_75.pdf

[32] J.C. Nickerson and R.T. McAdory, *Right-angle lever paradox*, Am. J. Phys. **43**, 615 (1975), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/nickerson_ajp_43_615_75.pdf

[33] A. Chammaro and A. Hernández, *On a "Solution" to Lewis-Tolman-Paradox-Like Problems in Relativistic States*, Lett. Nuovo Cim. **28**, 467 (1980), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/chamorro_lnc_28_467_80.pdf

[34] A. Hernández, M. Rivas and J.M. Aguirregabiria, *A Quantitative Analysis of the Trouton-Noble Experiment*, Nuovo Cim. B **72**, 1 (1982), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/hernandez_nc_72b_1_82.pdf

[35] A. Harpaz, *Trouton-Noble experiment*, Phys. Ed. **21**, 180 (1986), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/harpaz_pe_21_180_86.pdf

[36] H.-B. Ai, *The Historical Misconception in Relativistic Statics*, Nuovo Cim. B **108**, 7 (1993), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/ai_nc_108b_7_93.pdf

[37] A.K. Singal, *On the "explanation" of the null results of the Trouton-Noble experiment*, Am. J. Phys. **61**, 428 (1993), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/singal_ajp_61_428_93.pdf

[38] M.H.P. Janssen, *A comparison between Lorentz's ether theory and special relativity in the light of the experiments of Trouton and Noble*, Ph.D. Thesis (1995), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/janssen_95.pdf

[39] S.A. Teukolsky, *The explanation of the Trouton-Noble experiment*, Am. J. Phys. **64**, 1104 (1996), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/teukolsky_ajp_64_1104_96.pdf

[40] O.D. Jefimenko, *The Trouton-Noble paradox*, J. Phys. A **32**, 3755 (1999), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/jefimenko_jpa_32_3755_99.pdf

[41] P. Cornille; J.-L. Naudin and A. Szames, *Stimulated forces demonstrated: Why the Trouton-Noble experiment failed and how to make it succeed*, AIP Conf. Proc. **458**, 1005 (1999), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/cornille_aipcp_458_1005_99.pdf

[42] T. Ivezić, *Trouton-Noble paradox revisited* (June 20, 1999), https://arxiv.org/pdf/physics/0606176

[43] J. Franklin, *The lack of rotation in the Trouton-Noble experiment*, Eur. J. Phys. **27**, 1251 (2006), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/franklin_ejp_27_1251_06.pdf

[44] J. Franklin, *The lack of rotation in a moving right angle lever*, Eur. J. Phys. **29**, N55 (2008), http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/franklin_ejp_29_N55_08.pdf

[45] M. Janssen, *Drawing the line between kinematics and dynamics in special relativity*, Stud. Hist. Phil. Mod. Phys. **40**, 29 (2009).
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/janssen_shpmp_40_26_09.pdf

[46] "K. Brown", *Trouton-Noble and the Right-Angle Lever*,
https://www.mathpages.com/home/kmath651/kmath651.htm

[47] K.T. McDonald, *On the Definition of "Hidden" Momentum* (July 9, 2012),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/hiddendef.pdf

[48] D.A.T. Vanzella, *Relativistic paradox exposing the ubiquity of hidden momentum*, Phys. Rev. A **102**, 042203 (2020),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/GR/vanzella_pra_102_042203_20.pdf

[49] K.T. McDonald, *The Momentum of Heat* (Jan. 13, 2025),
http://kirkmcd.princeton.edu/examples/heat_momentum.pdf